JS 44 (Rev. 10/20)

# Case 2:24-cv-00386-NIO/1L COUNTERT SHELLE 01/26/24 Page 1 of 14

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON NEXT PAGE OF THIS FORM.)

| purpose of initiating the civil do  | ocket sheet. (SEE INSTRUC                                 | CTIONS ON NEXT PAGE C                                  | OF THIS FO      | ORM.)  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
|---|---|--|-----------------|--|-------------------|--|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| I. (a) PLAINTIFFS   |   |  |                 | DEFENDANT  | TS.               |  |                                |                                   |
| AMY GRABER  |   |  |                 | UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA & TRUSTEES OF THE   |                   |  |                                |                                   |
|   |   |  |                 | UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA   |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| (b) County of Residence of First Listed Plaintiff BUCKS  (EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES) |   |  |                 | County of Residence of First Listed Defendant PHILADELPHIA  (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| (EZ   | ICEFT IN O.S. FLAINTIFF CA                                | 4 <i>3E3)</i>  |                 | NOTE: IN LAND (  |                   | ATION CASES, USE T<br>O INVOLVED.        |                                |                                   |
| (c) Attorneys (Firm Name, A   | Address, and Telephone Numbe                              | or)  |                 | Attorneys (If Known  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
|   | -   |  |                 | 1 tttorne y 3 (1) Known  | <i>n</i> ,        |  |                                |                                   |
|   | Esq., Console Mattia<br>elphia, PA 19102 (2               |  | cust            |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| II. BASIS OF JURISD   | ICTION (Place an "X" in                                   | One Box Only)  | III. CI         | <br>   | PRINCII           | PAL PARTIES                              | (Place an "X" in One           | Box for Plaintiff                 |
| _   |   |  |                 | (For Diversity Cases Only  |                   |  | and One Box for Defe           |                                   |
| 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff   | ∠ 3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)        |  | Citize          | en of This State   | <b>PTF DI</b> □ 1 | 1 Incorporated or Pr<br>of Business In T | rincipal Place                 | PTF DEF                           |
| 2 U.S. Government<br>Defendant  | 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III) |  | Citize          | izen of Another State 2 2 Incorporated and Principal of Business In Another S              |                   |  | 5 5                            |                                   |
|   |   |  |                 | en or Subject of a [reign Country  | 3                 | 3 Foreign Nation                         |                                | 6 6                               |
| IV. NATURE OF SUIT  | (Place an "X" in One Box O                                | nly)   |                 |  | Click h           | ere for: Nature of S                     | Suit Code Descri               | iptions.                          |
| CONTRACT  |   | ORTS   | FC              | PRFEITURE/PENALTY  | Z B               | ANKRUPTCY                                | OTHER ST.                      | ATUTES                            |
| 110 Insurance   | PERSONAL INJURY   | PERSONAL INJURY  | Y 62            | 5 Drug Related Seizure   |                   | Appeal 28 USC 158                        | 375 False Clair                |                                   |
| 120 Marine<br>130 Miller Act  | 310 Airplane<br>315 Airplane Product                      | 365 Personal Injury -<br>Product Liability             | 69              | of Property 21 USC 881<br>0 Other  |                   | Withdrawal<br>28 USC 157                 | 376 Qui Tam (3<br>3729(a))     | 31 USC                            |
| 140 Negotiable Instrument   | Liability   | 367 Health Care/                                       |                 |  |                   |  | 400 State Reap                 | portionment                       |
| 150 Recovery of Overpayment<br>& Enforcement of Judgment                                  | 320 Assault, Libel & Slander                              | Pharmaceutical<br>Personal Injury                      |                 |  |                   | PERTY RIGHTS Copyrights                  | 410 Antitrust<br>430 Banks and | Donking                           |
| 151 Medicare Act  | 330 Federal Employers'                                    | Product Liability                                      |                 |  |                   | Patent                                   | 450 Commerce                   |                                   |
| 152 Recovery of Defaulted   | Liability   | 368 Asbestos Personal                                  |                 |  |                   | Patent - Abbreviated                     | 460 Deportatio                 |                                   |
| Student Loans<br>(Excludes Veterans)  | 340 Marine<br>345 Marine Product                          | Injury Product<br>Liability                            |                 |  |                   | New Drug Application Frademark           | 470 Racketeer                  | Influenced and rganizations       |
| 153 Recovery of Overpayment   | Liability   | PERSONAL PROPER  |                 | LABOR  | <b>—</b>          | Defend Trade Secrets                     | 480 Consumer                   | Credit                            |
| of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholders' Suits   | 350 Motor Vehicle   | 370 Other Fraud  | 71              | 0 Fair Labor Standards   | ·                 | Act of 2016                              |                                | 1681 or 1692)                     |
| 190 Other Contract  | 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability                       | 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal                | H <sub>72</sub> | Act 0 Labor/Management   | SOC               | CIAL SECURITY                            | 485 Telephone<br>Protection    |                                   |
| 195 Contract Product Liability  | 360 Other Personal  | Property Damage  |                 | Relations  | 861               | HIA (1395ff)                             | 490 Cable/Sat                  | TV                                |
| 196 Franchise   | Injury  362 Personal Injury -                             | 385 Property Damage                                    |                 | 0 Railway Labor Act<br>1 Family and Medical  |                   | Black Lung (923)                         | 850 Securities/                |                                   |
|   | Medical Malpractice                                       | Product Liability                                      | H'3             | Leave Act  |                   | DIWC/DIWW (405(g))<br>SSID Title XVI     | Exchange<br>890 Other State    |                                   |
| REAL PROPERTY   | CIVIL RIGHTS  | PRISONER PETITION                                      |                 | 0 Other Labor Litigation   | 865               | RSI (405(g))                             | 891 Agricultura                |                                   |
| 210 Land Condemnation<br>220 Foreclosure  | 440 Other Civil Rights 441 Voting                         | Habeas Corpus:  463 Alien Detainee                     | □79             | 1 Employee Retirement<br>Income Security Act   | EED               | EDAL TAVELITE                            | 893 Environme<br>895 Freedom o |                                   |
| 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment  | × 442 Employment  | 510 Motions to Vacate                                  | ,               | meonic Security Act  |                   | ERAL TAX SUITS Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff     | Act                            | 1 Illioillation                   |
| 240 Torts to Land   | 443 Housing/  | Sentence   |                 |  |                   | or Defendant)                            | 896 Arbitration                |                                   |
| 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property                                    | Accommodations 445 Amer. w/Disabilities -                 | 530 General 535 Death Penalty                          |                 | IMMIGRATION  | 871               | IRS—Third Party<br>26 USC 7609           |                                | ative Procedure<br>w or Appeal of |
| 250 All Other Real Property   | Employment  | Other:   | 46              | 2 Naturalization Applicati   | ion               | 20 030 7009                              | Agency De                      |                                   |
|   | 446 Amer. w/Disabilities -                                | 540 Mandamus & Oth                                     |                 | 5 Other Immigration  |                   |  | 950 Constitution               | onality of                        |
|   | Other 448 Education                                       | 550 Civil Rights<br>555 Prison Condition               |                 | Actions  |                   |  | State Statu                    | tes                               |
|   |   | 560 Civil Detainee -                                   |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
|   |   | Conditions of<br>Confinement                           |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| V. ORIGIN (Place an "X" is  | n One Box Only)   | Commenent  |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
|   |   | Remanded from  | □4 Rein         | stated or 5 Trans  | sferred from      | 6 Multidistr                             | rict                           | ultidistrict                      |
|   | te Court  | Appellate Court  | Reop            | ened Anotl   |                   | Litigation<br>Transfer                   | ı - Lit                        | tigation -<br>irect File          |
|   | Cite the U.S. Civil Sta                                   | atute under which you ar<br>seq.; 43 P.S. §951, et seq | re filing (1    | Do not cite jurisdictional s   | statutes unles    | s diversity):                            |                                |                                   |
| VI. CAUSE OF ACTION   | Brief description of ca                                   |  | ı., Fillia. O   | ode 39-1101, et seq., 2  | .9 0.3.0. 90.     | z i, et seq.                             |                                |                                   |
|   |   | ause.<br>ated against based on sex                     | c in violation  | on of local, state, and fe   | deral law.        |  |                                |                                   |
| VII. REQUESTED IN   | CHECK IF THIS   | IS A CLASS ACTION                                      | N D             | EMAND \$   |                   | CHECK YES only                           | if demanded in co              | mplaint:                          |
| COMPLAINT:  | UNDER RULE 2  |  |                 | excess of \$75,000   |                   | JURY DEMAND:                             | : ×Yes                         | No                                |
| VIII. RELATED CASI  | E(S)  |  |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| IF ANY  | (See instructions):                                       | ILIDGE   |                 |  | DO                | TET MIMDED                               |                                |                                   |
|   |   | JUDGE  |                 |  |                   | CKET NUMBER                              |                                |                                   |
| DATE<br>04/06/2004  |   | SIGNATURI DE ATT                                       | TORNEY (        | OF RECORD  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| 01/26/2024  |   | JAGINU 1000  |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| FOR OFFICE USE ONLY   |   |  |                 |  |                   |  |                                |                                   |
| DECEIPT # AN  | MOLINIT   | ADDI VING IED  |                 | HIDGE  |                   | MAG IIII                                 | DGE                            |                                   |

#### INSTRUCTIONS FOR ATTORNEYS COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET FORM JS 44

Authority For Civil Cover Sheet

The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and service of pleading or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. The attorney filing a case should complete the form as follows:

- **I.(a) Plaintiffs-Defendants.** Enter names (last, first, middle initial) of plaintiff and defendant. If the plaintiff or defendant is a government agency, use only the full name or standard abbreviations. If the plaintiff or defendant is an official within a government agency, identify first the agency and then the official, giving both name and title.
  - (b) County of Residence. For each civil case filed, except U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county where the first listed plaintiff resides at the time of filing. In U.S. plaintiff cases, enter the name of the county in which the first listed defendant resides at the time of filing. (NOTE: In land condemnation cases, the county of residence of the "defendant" is the location of the tract of land involved.)
- (c) Attorneys. Enter the firm name, address, telephone number, and attorney of record. If there are several attorneys, list them on an attachment, noting in this section "(see attachment)".
- II. Jurisdiction. The basis of jurisdiction is set forth under Rule 8(a), F.R.Cv.P., which requires that jurisdictions be shown in pleadings. Place an "X" in one of the boxes. If there is more than one basis of jurisdiction, precedence is given in the order shown below.

  United States plaintiff. (1) Jurisdiction based on 28 U.S.C. 1345 and 1348. Suits by agencies and officers of the United States are included here. United States defendant. (2) When the plaintiff is suing the United States, its officers or agencies, place an "X" in this box.

  Federal question. (3) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1331, where jurisdiction arises under the Constitution of the United States, an amendment to the Constitution, an act of Congress or a treaty of the United States. In cases where the U.S. is a party, the U.S. plaintiff or defendant code takes precedence, and box 1 or 2 should be marked.

  Diversity of citizenship. (4) This refers to suits under 28 U.S.C. 1332, where parties are citizens of different states. When Box 4 is checked, the citizenship of the different parties must be checked. (See Section III below; NOTE: federal question actions take precedence over diversity cases.)
- III. Residence (citizenship) of Principal Parties. This section of the JS 44 is to be completed if diversity of citizenship was indicated above. Mark this section for each principal party.
- IV. Nature of Suit. Place an "X" in the appropriate box. If there are multiple nature of suit codes associated with the case, pick the nature of suit code that is most applicable. Click here for: Nature of Suit Code Descriptions.
- V. Origin. Place an "X" in one of the seven boxes.
  - Original Proceedings. (1) Cases which originate in the United States district courts.

Removed from State Court. (2) Proceedings initiated in state courts may be removed to the district courts under Title 28 U.S.C., Section 1441. Remanded from Appellate Court. (3) Check this box for cases remanded to the district court for further action. Use the date of remand as the filing date.

Reinstated or Reopened. (4) Check this box for cases reinstated or reopened in the district court. Use the reopening date as the filing date. Transferred from Another District. (5) For cases transferred under Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1404(a). Do not use this for within district transfers or multidistrict litigation transfers.

Multidistrict Litigation – Transfer. (6) Check this box when a multidistrict case is transferred into the district under authority of Title 28 U.S.C. Section 1407.

Multidistrict Litigation – Direct File. (8) Check this box when a multidistrict case is filed in the same district as the Master MDL docket. **PLEASE NOTE THAT THERE IS NOT AN ORIGIN CODE 7.** Origin Code 7 was used for historical records and is no longer relevant due to changes in statue.

- VI. Cause of Action. Report the civil statute directly related to the cause of action and give a brief description of the cause. **Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity.** Example: U.S. Civil Statute: 47 USC 553 Brief Description: Unauthorized reception of cable service.
- VII. Requested in Complaint. Class Action. Place an "X" in this box if you are filing a class action under Rule 23, F.R.Cv.P.

  Demand. In this space enter the actual dollar amount being demanded or indicate other demand, such as a preliminary injunction.

  Jury Demand. Check the appropriate box to indicate whether or not a jury is being demanded.
- VIII. Related Cases. This section of the JS 44 is used to reference related pending cases, if any. If there are related pending cases, insert the docket numbers and the corresponding judge names for such cases.

Date and Attorney Signature. Date and sign the civil cover sheet.

# Case 2:24-cv-00386-NAQARD STORIUS TEST FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA Page 3 of 14

### **DESIGNATION FORM**

(to be used by counsel or pro se plaintiff to indicate the category of the case for the purpose of assignment to the appropriate calendar)

| Address of Plaintiff:   | Fairless Hills, PA 19030  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| Address of Defendant:  235 S. 33rd Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104   |   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction:   | a, PA   |  |  |  |  |  |
| RELATED CASE, IF ANY:   |   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Case Number:  | Judge:  | Date Terminated:   |  |  |  |  |
| Civil cases are deemed related when <i>Yes</i> is answered to any of the following questions:   |   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Is this case related to property included in an ear previously terminated action in this court?   | Yes No 🗸  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Does this case involve the same issue of fact or pending or within one year previously terminate.   |   | Yes No 🗸   |  |  |  |  |
| 3. Does this case involve the validity or infringem numbered case pending or within one year prev   |   | Yes No V   |  |  |  |  |
| 4. Is this case a second or successive habeas corpu case filed by the same individual?  | is, social security appeal, or pro se civil rights  | Yes No 🗸   |  |  |  |  |
| I certify that, to my knowledge, the within case this court except as noted above.  DATE: 01/26/2024  | is / • is not related to any case now pending or w  | 307548  Attorney I.D. # (if applicable)  |  |  |  |  |
|   |   |  |  |  |  |  |
| CIVIL: (Place a vin one category only)  |   |  |  |  |  |  |
| CIVIL: (Place a √ in one category only)  A. Federal Question Cases:   | B. Diversity Jurisdiction C   | Cases:   |  |  |  |  |
|   | All Other Contracts  1. Insurance Contracts  2. Airplane Persona  3. Assault, Defama  4. Marine Personal  5. Motor Vehicle P  | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury tersonal Injury njury (Please specify):  ty y — Asbestos ity Cases |  |  |  |  |
| A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and 2. FELA 3. Jones Act-Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Patent 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 8. Habeas Corpus 9. Securities Act(s) Cases 10. Social Security Review Cases 11. All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify):   | All Other Contracts  1. Insurance Contracts  2. Airplane Personal 3. Assault, Defama 4. Marine Personal 5. Motor Vehicle P 6. Other Personal II 7. Products Liabilit 8. Products Liabilit 9. All other Diversi (Please specify):                      | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury tersonal Injury njury (Please specify):  ty Asbestos ity Cases     |  |  |  |  |
| A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and FELA 2. FELA 3. Jones Act-Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Patent 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 8. Habeas Corpus 9. Securities Act(s) Cases 10. Social Security Review Cases 11. All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify):  (The effect   | All Other Contracts  1. Insurance Contracts  2. Airplane Personal 3. Assault, Defama 4. Marine Personal 5. Motor Vehicle P 6. Other Personal II 7. Products Liabilit 8. Products Liabilit 9. All other Diversi (Please specify):                      | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury tersonal Injury njury (Please specify):  ty Asbestos ity Cases     |  |  |  |  |
| A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and 2. FELA 3. Jones Act-Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Patent 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 8. Habeas Corpus 9. Securities Act(s) Cases 10. Social Security Review Cases 11. All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify):  (The effect  | All Other Contracts    1. Insurance Contracts   2. Airplane Personal   3. Assault, Defama   4. Marine Personal   5. Motor Vehicle P   6. Other Personal II   7. Products Liabilite   8. Products Liabilite   9. All other Diversing (Please specify): | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury dersonal Injury njury (Please specify):                            |  |  |  |  |
| A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and 2. FELA 3. Jones Act-Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Patent 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 8. Habeas Corpus 9. Securities Act(s) Cases 10. Social Security Review Cases 11. All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify):  (The effect  | All Other Contracts    1.   | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury dersonal Injury njury (Please specify):                            |  |  |  |  |
| A. Federal Question Cases:  1. Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and 2. FELA 3. Jones Act-Personal Injury 4. Antitrust 5. Patent 6. Labor-Management Relations 7. Civil Rights 8. Habeas Corpus 9. Securities Act(s) Cases 10. Social Security Review Cases 11. All other Federal Question Cases (Please specify):  (The effect I, Rahul Munshi Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, § 3(c) (2) exceed the sum of \$150,000.00 exclusive of | All Other Contracts    1.   | act and Other Contracts al Injury tion Injury dersonal Injury njury (Please specify):                            |  |  |  |  |

# Case 2:24-cv-00386-NIQA Document 1 Filed 01/26/24 Page 4 of 14

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

# CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

| Telephone   | FAX Nur   | nber   | E-Mail Address   |                                 |  |
|---|---|--|--|---------------------------------|--|
| 215-545-7676  | 215-827-5101  |  | munshi@consolelaw.com  |                                 |  |
| Date  | Attorney-   | at-law   | Attorney for   |                                 |  |
| 01/26/2024  | Rahul Munshi  |  | Plaintiff, Amy Graber  |                                 |  |
| (f) Standard Management   | t – Cases that do n   | ot fall into   | any one of the other tracks.   | (X)                             |  |
| commonly referred to  | as complex and th   | nat need spe   | racks (a) through (d) that are ecial or intense management by led explanation of special   | ( )                             |  |
| (d) Asbestos – Cases invo exposure to asbestos.   | lving claims for p  | ersonal inj  | ary or property damage from  | ( )                             |  |
| (c) Arbitration – Cases red   | quired to be design   | nated for a  | bitration under Local Civil Rule 53.2.   | ( )                             |  |
| (b) Social Security – Case and Human Services d   | es requesting revie<br>lenying plaintiff S  | w of a deci<br>ocial Secur   | sion of the Secretary of Health ity Benefits.  | ( )                             |  |
| (a) Habeas Corpus – Cases brought under 28 U.S.C. § 2241 through § 2255.                                      |   |  |  |                                 |  |
| SELECT ONE OF THE   | FOLLOWING C   | SASE MAN   | AGEMENT TRACKS:  |                                 |  |
| plaintiff shall complete a Giling the complaint and se side of this form.) In the designation, that defendant | Case Management rve a copy on all de event that a defeat shall, with its fir parties, a Case Ma | Track Desert Track | ay Reduction Plan of this court, counse ignation Form in all civil cases at the tir (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the resonot agree with the plaintiff regarding ace, submit to the clerk of court and services. Designation Form specifying the igned. | ne of<br>verse<br>said<br>ve on |  |
| UNIVERIS<br>PENNSYLVAI  |   | :  | NO.  |                                 |  |
| AMY GRA<br>v.   | ADEK  | :  |  |                                 |  |
| AMW CD A  | DED   | :  | CIVIL ACTION   |                                 |  |

(Civ. 660) 10/02

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

\_\_\_\_\_

AMY GRABER : Fairless Hills, PA 19030 :

:

Plaintiff, :

CIVIL ACTION NO.

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA

235 S. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street

Philadelphia, PA 19104

v.

:

and

:

TRUSTEES OF THE UNIVERSITY

OF PENNSYLVANIA 235 S. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street

Philadelphia, PA 19104

:

Defendants.

\_\_\_\_\_

# **COMPLAINT**

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Plaintiff, Amy Graber, brings this employment discrimination action against her former employers, University of Pennsylvania and Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania (collectively, "UPenn" or "Defendants"). In 2022, UPenn failed to promote Plaintiff to the Head Athletic Trainer position, for which she was exceptionally qualified. Instead of selecting Plaintiff, UPenn promoted a substantially younger, male employee who had less supervisory authority and fewer years of service with UPenn than Plaintiff.

Plaintiff was discriminated against because of her sex in violation of Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended, 42 U.S.C. §2000e, *et seq.* ("Title VII"), the Pennsylvania Human Relations Act, as amended, 43 P.S. §951, *et seq.* ("PHRA"), and the Philadelphia Fair

Practices Ordinance, Phila. Code §9-1101, et seq. ("PFPO"). Plaintiff was also discriminated against because of her age in violation of the Age Discrimination in Employment Act, as amended, 29 U.S.C. §621, et seq. ("ADEA"), the PHRA, and the PFPO. Plaintiff seeks all damages, including economic loss, compensatory, liquidated, and punitive damages, and all other relief under applicable federal and state law as this Court deems appropriate.

# II. PARTIES

- 1. Plaintiff, Amy Graber, is a female individual and citizen of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.
- 2. Plaintiff was forty-six (46) years old when her employment with Defendants ended in 2022.
  - 3. UPenn is a private research university based on Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- 4. UPenn is engaged in an industry affecting interstate commerce and regularly does business in Pennsylvania.
  - 5. At all times material hereto, UPenn employed more than twenty (20) individuals.
- 6. At all times material hereto, Defendants have had integrated operations, have had shared ownership, have had common management, and have had centralized control over their employment matters.
- 7. At all times material hereto, Defendants have acted as a single employer, joint employers, and/or alter egos. The operations of Defendants are substantively consolidated.
- 8. At all times material hereto, UPenn has acted as an "employer" within the meaning of the statutes which form the basis of this matter.
- 9. At all times material hereto, Plaintiff was an "employee" of UPenn within the meaning of the statutes which form the basis of this matter.

10. At all times material hereto, Defendant acted by and through its authorized agents, servants, workmen, and/or employees acting within the course and scope of their employment with Defendant and in furtherance of Defendant's businesses.

### III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 11. The causes of action which form the basis of this matter arise under Title VII, the ADEA, the PHRA, and the PFPO.
- 12. The District Court has jurisdiction over Count I (Title VII) pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §2000e-5 and 28 U.S.C. §1331.
- 13. The District Court has jurisdiction over Count II (ADEA) pursuant to 29 U.S.C. §626(c) and 28 U.S.C. §1331.
- 14. The District Court has supplemental jurisdiction over Count III (PHRA) pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1367.
- 15. The District Court has supplemental jurisdiction over Count IV (PFPO) pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §1367.
- 16. Venue is proper in the District Court under 28 U.S.C. §1391(b)(2) because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim occurred within this District.
- 17. On or about September 7, 2022, Plaintiff filed a Complaint of Discrimination with the Pennsylvania Human Relations Commission ("PHRC"), and dual-filed with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission ("EEOC"), complaining of the acts of discrimination alleged herein. Attached hereto, incorporated herein and marked as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of the PHRC/EEOC Complaint of Discrimination.
- 18. On or about November 1, 2023, the EEOC issued to Plaintiff a Notice of Right to Sue. Attached hereto, incorporated herein and marked as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of

that notice.

19. Plaintiff has fully complied with all administrative prerequisites for the commencement of this action.

## IV. FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 20. Plaintiff was born in July 1976.
- 21. Plaintiff has a B.S. in athletic training and a M.Ed. in Sport and Recreation Management from Temple University. She is a member of the National Athletic Trainers Association.
  - 22. She commenced employment with UPenn on or around March 27, 2006.
  - 23. Plaintiff last held the position of Associate Head Athletic Trainer.
- 24. Plaintiff worked primarily with the women's volleyball, women's basketball, and the swimming, diving, and rowing teams at UPenn.
- 25. Plaintiff consistently performed her job duties in a highly competent manner and received positive feedback.
  - 26. Plaintiff last reported to Emily Dorman (female, 39<sup>1</sup>), Head Athletic Trainer.
  - 27. In June 2022, Plaintiff received a positive performance evaluation from Dorman.
- 28. Prior to her resignation of employment in June 2022, Dorman reported to Brian Rudy Fuller (male, 51), Senior Associate Athletic Director.
- 29. After announcing her resignation, Dorman asked Plaintiff if she was interested in being promoted to the Head Athletic Trainer position that Dorman would be vacating.
- 30. Plaintiff responded to Dorman that she would be interested in the promotion, and Dorman appeared pleased with Plaintiff's response.
  - 31. On or around June 18, 2022, Plaintiff expressed her interest in being promoted to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ages contained herein are approximates.

the Head Athletic Trainer position to Fuller.

- 32. Fuller stated that the position would be posted and that Plaintiff could apply for it.
- 33. Plaintiff applied for the Head Athletic Trainer position in June 2022.
- 34. Plaintiff was qualified for the position of Head Athletic Trainer.
- 35. On or around July 11, 2022, Plaintiff interviewed for the Head Athletic Trainer position with Fuller, Associate Assistant Director Joy DeJesus (female, 50), Women's Gymnastics Head Coach Kirsten Becker (female, 31), and Coach for Strength and Conditioning Cory Walts (male, 39).
- 36. On July 15, 2022, Plaintiff learned from Fuller that she was not selected for promotion to Head Athletic Trainer, nor was she selected for the second round of interviews for the position.
- 37. Fuller's stated reason for not promoting Plaintiff was that Defendants were going in a different direction.
- 38. Fuller further stated that the issues that Plaintiff outlined in her mission statement regarding problems Plaintiff wanted to address within the department were things about which UPenn already had knowledge.
- 39. Instead of advancing Plaintiff to the second round of interviews, UPenn advanced Head Football Athletic Trainer Anthony Erz (male, 33) and an external candidate, Vick Szwanki (male, 35).
  - 40. Ultimately, UPenn selected Erz for the Head Athletic Trainer position.
- 41. Plaintiff was more qualified for the position and had longer service time with UPenn than the substantially younger, male candidate who UPenn promoted.
  - 42. Erz has been employed by UPenn since 2015.

- 43. Further, Plaintiff had broader duties and responsibilities than Erz at the time the decision was made.
- 44. On or around July 29, 2022, Plaintiff submitted a letter of resignation to Fuller, effective August 12, 2022.
- 45. Plaintiff resigned from her employment with UPenn because of the sex and/or age discrimination to which she as subjected, including UPenn's failure to promote Plaintiff because of her sex and/or age.
- 46. Plaintiff's sex was a motivating and/or determinative factor in UPenn's discriminatory treatment of Plaintiff and in UPenn's failure to promote Plaintiff.
- 47. Plaintiff's age was a motivating and/or determinative factor in UPenn's discriminatory treatment of Plaintiff and in UPenn's failure to promote Plaintiff.
- 48. As a direct and proximate result of the discriminatory conduct of Defendants, Plaintiff has in the past incurred, and may in the future incur, a loss of earnings and/or earning capacity, loss of benefits, pain and suffering, embarrassment, humiliation, loss of self-esteem, mental anguish, and loss of life's pleasures, the full extent of which is not known at this time.
- 49. The conduct of Defendants, as set forth above, was outrageous under the circumstances, was done by and with the knowledge of upper management and warrants the imposition of punitive damages against Defendants.
  - 50. The conduct of Defendants, as set forth above, was willful and intentional.

### **COUNT I (TITLE VII)**

- 51. Plaintiff incorporates herein by reference paragraphs 1 through 50 above, as if set forth herein in their entirety.
  - 52. By committing the foregoing acts of discrimination against Plaintiff on the basis

of Plaintiff's sex, Defendants have violated Title VII.

- 53. Said violations were willful and intentional and warrant the imposition of punitive damages.
- 54. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants' violation of Title VII, Plaintiff has suffered the damages and losses set forth herein.
- 55. Plaintiff is now suffering and will continue to suffer irreparable injury and monetary damages as a result of Defendants' discriminatory acts unless and until this Court grants the relief requested herein.
  - 56. No previous application has been made for the relief requested herein.

#### **COUNT II (ADEA)**

- 57. Plaintiff incorporates herein by reference paragraphs 1 through 56 above, as if set forth herein in their entirety.
- 58. By committing the foregoing acts of discrimination against Plaintiff, Defendants have violated the ADEA.
  - 59. Said violations were willful and warrant the imposition of liquidated damages.
- 60. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants' violation of the ADEA, Plaintiff has suffered the damages and losses set forth herein and has incurred attorneys' fees and costs.
- 61. Plaintiff is now suffering and will continue to suffer irreparable injury and monetary damages as a result of Defendants' discriminatory acts unless and until this Court grants the relief requested herein.
  - 62. No previous application has been made for the relief requested herein.

## **COUNT III (PHRA)**

- 63. Plaintiff incorporates herein by reference paragraphs 1 through 62 above, as if set forth herein in their entirety.
- 64. Defendants, by committing the foregoing acts of discrimination, have violated the PHRA.
- 65. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants' violations of the PHRA, Plaintiff has sustained the injuries, damages and losses set forth herein.
- 66. Plaintiff is now suffering and will continue to suffer irreparable injuries and monetary damages as a result of Defendants' discriminatory acts unless and until the Court grants the relief requested herein.
  - 67. No previous application has been made for the relief requested herein.

### COUNT IV (PFPO)

- 68. Plaintiff incorporates herein by reference paragraphs 1 through 67 above, as if set forth herein in their entirety.
- 69. Defendants, by committing the foregoing acts of discrimination, have violated the PFPO.
- 70. Said violations were willful and intentional and warrant the imposition of punitive damages.
- 71. As a direct and proximate result of Defendants' violations of the PFPO, Plaintiff has sustained the injuries, damages and losses set forth herein.
- 72. Plaintiff is now suffering and will continue to suffer irreparable injuries and monetary damages as a result of Defendants' discriminatory acts unless and until the Court grants the relief requested herein.

73. No previous application has been made for the relief requested herein.

#### **RELIEF**

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests that this Court enter judgment in favor of Plaintiff, Amy Graber, and against UPenn. Plaintiff seeks damages and legal and equitable relief in connection with Defendants' improper conduct, and specifically prays that the Court grant the following relief to the Plaintiff by:

- a) declaring the acts and practices complained of herein to be in violation of Title VII;
- b) declaring the acts and practices complained of herein to be in violation of the ADEA;
- c) declaring the acts and practices complained of herein to be in violation of the PHRA;
- d) declaring the acts and practices complained of herein to be in violation of the PFPO;
- e) enjoining and permanently restraining the violations alleged herein;
- f) entering judgment against Defendants in favor of Plaintiff in an amount to be determined;
- g) awarding compensatory damages to Plaintiff to make Plaintiff whole for all past and future lost earnings, benefits and earnings capacity which Plaintiff has suffered and will continue to suffer as a result of Defendants' discriminatory and unlawful misconduct;
- h) awarding compensatory damages to Plaintiff for past and future emotional upset, mental anguish, humiliation, loss of life's pleasures and pain and suffering, which Plaintiff has suffered or may suffer as a result of Defendants' improper conduct;
- i) awarding liquidated damages to Plaintiff under the ADEA;
- i) awarding punitive damages to Plaintiff under Title VII and the PFPO;
- k) awarding Plaintiff such other damages as are appropriate under Title VII, the ADEA,

the PHRA, and the PFPO;

- awarding Plaintiff the costs of suit, expert fees and other disbursements, and reasonable attorneys' fees; and,
- m) granting such other and further relief as this Court may deem just, proper, or equitable including other equitable and injunctive relief providing restitution for past violations and preventing future violations.

# CONSOLE MATTIACCI LAW, LLC

Dated: January 26, 2024 By: /s/ Rahul Munshi

Rahul Munshi
1525 Locust Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102
munshi@consolelaw.com
215-545-7676

215-545-7676 215-827-5201 (fax)

Attorneys for Plaintiff, Amy Graber